

SENATE SELECT COMMITTEE ON JUDICIAL OVERSIGHT AND REFORM

## 69th Montana Legislature

SENATE MEMBERS Mary Ann Dunwell Janet Ellis Jason Ellsworth Daniel Emrich Steve Fitzpatrick Chris Friedel Carl Glimm Jen Gross Steve Hinebauch Tom McGillvray Wendy McKamey Shane Morigeau Mark Noland Andrea Olsen Barry Usher

HOUSE MEMBERS Lyn Hellegaard Fiona Nave Sue Vinton PUBLIC MEMBERS Andrew Billstein Joan Mell Jim Ramlow **COMMITTEE STAFF** Jolanda Songer - Secretary Jameson Walker - Attorney

# **MINUTES LOG**

July 29, 2024 Room 137 Helena, Montana

Please note: This document is a Minutes Log and provides annotation of the time elapsed between the beginning of the meeting and the time at which the item was presented or discussed, a motion was made, or a vote was taken. The narrative presented here is provided only as a guide to the audio or video recording of the meeting. The official discussion, motion, or vote is available on the audio or video archive of this meeting. The Legislature does not prepare a transcript of the meeting activities. The time designation may be used to locate the referenced discussion on the audio or video recording of this meeting.

Access to an electronic copy of these minutes and the audio or video recording is provided from the Legislative Branch home page at <a href="https://leg.mt.gov">https://leg.mt.gov</a>. From the home page, select the "Committees" drop down menu at the top, then select Administrative or Interim, and the appropriate committee. The written minutes log can be located by expanding the accordion menu for the date of the meeting. Links to the audio/video files can be located by selecting the Video/Audio button on the same page, then the "past/current recordings" button. From there, use the calendar to select the date of the meeting you wish to view/listen to. The written Minutes Log, along with links to the audio and video recordings, is listed by meeting date on the interim committee's web page. Each of the Exhibits is linked and can be viewed by clicking on the Exhibit of interest. All Exhibits are public information and may be printed. Please contact the Legislative Services Division at 406-444-3064 for more information.

## **MEMBERS PRESENT:**

Sen. Jason Ellsworth, Presiding Officer (R) Sen. Barry Usher, Vice Presiding Officer (R) Sen. Chris Friedel (R) Sen. Mark Noland (R) Sen. Carl Glimm (R) Sen. Carl Glimm (R) Sen. Steve Hinebauch (R) Sen. Tom McGillvray (R) Sen. Wendy McKamey (R) Rep. Sue Vinton (R) Rep. Sue Vinton (R) Rep. Lyn Hellegaard (R) Rep. Fiona Nave (R) Joan Mell, Public Member Jim Ramlow, Public Member Andrew Billstein, Public Member

## **MEMBERS EXCUSED:**

Sen. Daniel Emrich (R) Sen. Steve Fitzpatrick (R)

## MEMBERS ABSENT:

Sen. Jen Gross (D) Sen. Andrea Olsen (D) Sen. Shane Morigeau (D) Sen. Mary Ann Dunwell (D) Sen. Janet Ellis (D)

## STAFF PRESENT:

Jolanda Songer, Secretary Jameson Walker, Attorney

## AGENDA (Attachment 1)

## VISITORS' LIST (Attachment 2)

## CALL TO ORDER / ROLL CALL

09:00:10 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth called the meeting to order at 9:00 AM. The committee secretary took roll.

## PERSPECTIVES FROM FORMER DISTRICT COURT JUDGE BLAIR JONES

- 09:01:49 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 09:02:19 Former Judge Blair Jones, 22nd Judicial District, Stillwater, Carbon, and Big Horn Counties <u>EXHIBIT 1</u>
- 09:05:58 Sen. Chris Friedel joined the meeting.
- 09:15:49 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth

## **Committee Questions / Discussion**

09:16:28 Vice Presiding Officer Barry Usher

## **Public Comment**

09:17:20 None

## **Committee Questions / Discussion**

- 09:17:44 Hon. Blair Jones, 22nd Judicial District
- EXHIBIT 2
- 09:33:28 Sen. Tom McGillvray
- 09:37:53 Hon. Blair Jones
- 09:44:00 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 09:44:56 Vice Presiding Officer Barry Usher
- 09:45:51 Hon. Blair Jones

- 09:53:04 Joan Mell
- 09:54:30 Hon. Blair Jones
- 10:10:33 Sen. Mark Noland
- 10:12:22 Hon. Blair Jones
- 10:17:52 Sen. Steve Hinebauch
- 10:19:56 Hon. Blair Jones
- 10:28:07 Vice Presiding Officer Barry Usher
- 10:30:13 Hon. Blair Jones
- 10:30:40 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 10:31:08 Hon. Blair Jones
- 10:44:14 Jim Ramlow
- 10:45:25 Hon. Blair Jones
- 10:52:59 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 10:57:44 **Recess**
- 11:09:41 **Reconvened**

## PERSPECTIVES FROM FORMER DISTRICT COURT JUDGE BLAIR JONES - Continued

- 11:09:43 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 11:10:24 Hon. Blair Jones
- 11:11:35 Jim Ramlow
- 11:20:44 Sen. Wendy McKamey
- 11:21:42 Joan Mell
- 11:23:02 Hon. Blair Jones
- 11:41:41 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 11:42:49 Rep. Fiona Nave
- 11:42:56 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 11:43:40 Hon. Blair Jones
- 11:50:06 Sen. Tom McGillvray
- 11:50:43 Hon. Blair Jones
- 11:58:46 Sen. Mark Noland
- 11:59:13 Hon. Blair Jones
- 12:05:45 Sen. Steve Hinebauch
- 12:07:14 Hon. Blair Jones
- 12:15:36 Sen. Mark Noland
- 12:16:00 Hon. Blair Jones
- 12:17:02 Vice Presiding Officer Barry Usher
- 12:18:07 Hon. Blair Jones
- 12:21:03 Sen. Tom McGillvray
- 12:21:26 Hon. Blair Jones

- 12:23:11 Rep. Fiona Nave
- 12:24:18 Hon. Blair Jones
- 12:26:32 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 12:27:35 Hon. Blair Jones
- 12:31:53 Vice Presiding Officer Barry Usher
- 12:32:46 Hon. Blair Jones
- 12:38:44 **Recess**
- 14:02:30 **Reconvene**

## PERSPECTIVES FROM ATTORNEYS

- 14:03:01 Peter F. Habein, Attorney, Billings
- 14:22:52 Mark Parker, Attorney, Billings

## **Public Comment**

- 14:31:43 Bruce Spencer, State Bar of Montana
- 14:38:09 Peter F. Habein, Billings
- 14:38:44 Mark Murphy
- 14:43:58 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth

## **Committee Questions / Discussion**

- 14:45:46 Sen. Mark Noland
- 14:46:22 Bruce Spencer, State Bar of Montana
- 14:47:10 Peter F. Habein
- 14:48:39 Mark Parker, Billings
- 14:54:22 Joan Mell
- 14:55:15 Peter F. Habein
- 14:56:47 Mark Parker
- 15:03:50 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 15:04:09 Sen. Tom McGillivray
- 15:05:19 Peter F. Habein
- 15:10:02 Joan Mell
- 15:10:51 Peter F. Habein
- 15:17:08 Mark Parker
- 15:19:38 Sen. Steve Hinebauch
- 15:21:56 Peter F. Habein
- 15:31:50 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 15:32:07 Peter F. Habein
- 15:32:25 Mark Parker
- 15:36:31 Vice Presiding Officer Barry Usher

## DISCUSS DRAFT INQUIRY LETTER RE: APPOINTMENT OF RETIRED JUDGES

15:36:53	Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
	(See Exhibit 2)

## Discussion

- 15:39:14 Rep. Lyn Hellegaard
- 15:39:42 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 15:41:04 Vice Presiding Officer Barry Usher
- 15:41:21 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth

## Motion

15:41:59 Vice Presiding Officer Barry Usher moved to accept the Letter of Inquiry regarding Appointment Judges, with the proposed change to add all names of the members of the Senate Select Committee on Judicial Oversight and Reform (SJOR).

## **Discussion on the Motion**

- 15:42:04 Sen. Wendy McKamey
- 15:43:01 Rep. Sue Vinton seconded the motion.
- 15:43:40 Vice Presiding Officer Barry Usher altered his motion to list the names of the members in the committee present for this meeting, rather than all persons of the committee.
- 15:44:35 Sen. Chris Friedel
- 15:45:30 Vice Presiding Officer Barry Usher clarified his motion should be to list the names of the voting members in the committee, rather than all members of the committee.
- 15:47:03 Jim Ramlow
- 15:48:29 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 15:48:46 Andrew Billstein
- 15:49:55 Sen. Steve Hinebauch
- 15:50:20 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 15:51:32 Bruce Spencer, State Bar of Montana
- 15:52:08 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 15:52:20 Vice Presiding Officer Barry Usher amended his motion to list the names of the members in the committee that opt in to their names being listed rather than all members of the committee, with the correction that Bruce Spencer mentioned.

## Vote

15:52:37 Carried unanimously by roll call vote.

## **Discussion on the Vote**

- 15:54:21 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 15:54:46 Sen. Wendy McKamey
- 15:55:13 Sen. Tom McGillvray
- 15:55:24 Vice Presiding Officer Barry Usher

- 15:55:33 Sen. Mark Noland
- 15:55:44 Joan Mell
- 15:56:06 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 15:56:14 Rep. Sue Vinton
- 15:56:44 Vice Presiding Officer Barry Usher

# DISCUSSION, DIRECTIONS TO STAFF FOR A JUDICIAL PERFORMANCE EVALUATIONS DRAFT LEGISLATION

- 15:57:15 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 15:57:40 Rachel Weiss, Research Director, Legislative Services Division (LSD) <u>EXHIBIT 3</u>

## **Committee Questions / Discussion**

- 16:04:31 Sen. Tom McGillvray
- 16:05:55 Sen. Chris Friedel
- 16:06:56 Sen. Wendy McKamey
- 16:07:58 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 16:08:22 Andrew Billstein
- 16:09:01 Rep. Fiona Nave
- 16:09:36 Joan Mell
- 16:10:21 Vice Presiding Officer Barry Usher
- 16:10:55 Sen. Wendy McKamey
- 16:11:06 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 16:12:36 Sen. Tom McGillvray
- 16:12:53 Rachel Weiss, LSD
- 16:13:11 Sen. Tom McGillvray (See Exhibit 3)
- 16:14:25 Vice Presiding Officer Barry Usher
- 16:14:39 Sen. Tom McGillvray
- 16:15:07 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 16:15:38 Rep. Lyn Hellegaard
- 16:16:05 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 16:16:33 Vice Presiding Officer Barry Usher
- 16:16:56 Sen. Tom McGillvray
- 16:17:35 Rachel Weiss
- 16:18:13 Rep. Fiona Nave
- 16:18:35 Sen. Tom McGillvray
- 16:18:47 Rachel Weiss
- 16:19:01 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 16:20:10 Sen. Tom McGillvray
- 16:21:06 Vice Presiding Officer Barry Usher
- 16:21:18 Sen. Wendy McKamey

- 16:22:35 Sen. Wendy McKamey
- 16:22:49 Rep. Fiona Nave
- 16:23:25 Andrew Billstein
- 16:24:10 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 16:24:56 Jameson Walker, Legislative Attorney, LSD
- 16:25:41 Sen. Chris Friedel
- 16:26:01 Jameson Walker, LSD
- 16:26:26 Sen. Wendy McKamey
- 16:26:55 Vice Presiding Officer Barry Usher
- 16:27:10 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 16:27:50 Sen. Tom McGillvray
- 16:29:25 Andrew Billstein
- 16:30:03 Sen. Tom McGillvray
- 16:30:43 Sen. Steve Hinebauch
- 16:31:23 Sen. Tom McGillvray
- 16:31:33 Rachel Weiss
- 16:32:00 Sen. Tom McGillvray
- 16:32:08 Vice Presiding Officer Barry Usher
- 16:32:37 Sen. Tom McGillvray
- 16:32:47 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 16:32:51 Sen. Tom McGillvray
- 16:33:11 Vice Presiding Officer Barry Usher
- 16:33:43 Rachel Weiss
- 16:34:11 Presiding Officer Jason Ellsworth
- 16:34:21 Joan Mell

# PUBLIC COMMENT ON ANY TOPIC UNDER THE COMMITTEE'S JURISDICTION

16:35:32 None

# ADJOURNMENT

Adjournment: 16:36:00